

Strengthening primary Medical care in IsoLated and deprived
cross-border arEas



D.6.1.2.B

2nd Evaluation and Impact Assessment Report

Contract ID

Contract title	Technical Assistance to the 4th Health District of Macedonia Thrace for the Project "Strengthening primary Medical care in IsoLated and deprived cross-border area" - SMiLe, within the framework of the Interreg V-A "Greece-Bulgaria 2014-2020" Cooperation Programme
Contract No	18SYMV003444283
Contracting Authority:	4 th Health District of Macedonia Thrace
Contactor:	planO ₂ Consulting Private Company
Corresponding Contract Deliverable	D.6.1.2.B 2 nd Evaluation and Impact Assessment Report
Author(s):	Papaioannou Ioanna Tsekeridis Vasileios Argyropoulou Kiriaki Papaioannou Christos Gkiouzepas Giorgos

Review History

Version	Date	Reviewed by	Justification

Deliverable ID

Project Code:	5012828
Acronym:	SMiLe
Project Title:	Strengthening primary Medical care in IsoLated and deprived cross-border arEas

Deliverable:	2nd Evaluation and Impact Assessment Report
Version:	V.1.0

Description:	The 2 nd Evaluation and Impact Assessment Report describes the rationale and presents the system for monitoring, evaluation and assessment of the SMiLe project.
Keywords:	[SMiLe, Information, Publicity, Dissemination Plan, Visual Identity, Cross-border Health, Healthcare, Interreg V-A "Greece-Bulgaria 2014-2020" Cooperation Programme, cross-border cooperation, European Union, Thessaloniki, Ardino, Harmanli]

Target Audience

Leader	Description/Purpose	Audience
LB	The 1st Evaluation and Impact Assessment Report describes the rationale and presents the system for monitoring, evaluation and assessment of the SMiLe project	Project stakeholders Including the project sponsor, senior leadership and the project team

DISCLAIMER

This publication has been created with the financial support of the European Union. The content of the publication is under the sole responsibility of 4th Health District of Macedonia Thrace and can under no circumstances be considered to represent the views of the European Union, the participating countries, the Managing Authority and the Joint Secretariat.

Project Partners

Role	Partner name	Country
------	--------------	---------

Lead Beneficiary	4th Health District of Macedonia Thrace	Greece
Partner Beneficiary 2	Aristotle University of Thessaloniki - Special Account for Research Fund (Department of Medicine)	Greece
Partner Beneficiary 3	Multi-profile Hospital for Active Treatment of Ardino	Bulgaria
Partner Beneficiary 4	Municipality of Harmanli	Bulgaria
Partner Beneficiary 5	National Emergency Aid Center	Greece

Short presentation of the programme

The Cooperation Programme "Greece-Bulgaria 2014-2020" was approved by the European Commission on 09/09/2015 by Decision C(2015) 6283. The total budget (ERDF and national contribution) for the European Territorial Programme "Greece-Bulgaria 2007-2013" is €129,695,572.00. The total financing consists of €110.241.234,00 (85%) ERDF funding and €19.434.338,00 (15%) national contribution. The eligible area of the Programme consists of the Region of Eastern Macedonia-Thrace (Regional Units of Evros, Kavala, Xanthi, Rodopi and Drama) and the Region of Central Macedonia (Regional Units of Thessaloniki and Serres) in Greece and the South-Central Planning Region and South-West Planning Region (Districts of Blagoevgrad, Smolyan, Kardjali and Haskovo) in Bulgaria. The Priority Axes are PA 1: A competitive and Innovative Cross-Border area, PA 2: A Sustainable and climate adaptable Cross-Border area PA, 3: A better interconnected Cross-Border area, PA 4: A socially inclusive Cross-Border area.

Abbreviations

AF: Application Form

CB: Cross Border (area)

JoB: justification of Budget

JS: Joins Secretariat

LB: Lead Beneficiary

MA: Managing Authority

PB: Partner beneficiary

STPP: Start-up Time Plan and Procurement Plan

WBS: Work breakdown structure

Table of Contents

1	Heading 1 _____	Σφάλμα! Δεν έχει οριστεί σελιδοδείκτης.
1.1	Heading 2	Σφάλμα! Δεν έχει οριστεί σελιδοδείκτης.
1.1.1	Heading 3 _____	16

List of Tables and Figures

Figure 1 : Captions like this.....Σφάλμα! Δεν έχει οριστεί σελιδοδείκτης.

1 Introduction

The scope of the current deliverable is to assess the extent to which the SMiLe project has been successful in terms of implementation progress and efficiency, identify possible issues concerning its implementation, assesses aspects of the management structure, such as the internal communication, and finally evaluate the external communication of the project.

The deliverable is organized in the following chapters.

The 2nd Chapter gives a brief overview of the SMiLe project, its scope, structure, and partners.

The 3rd Chapter focuses on the effectiveness of the implementation process. It takes into account the internal indicators (output and communication indicator), the programme level indicators, and lastly the financial indicators.

Chapter 4 focuses on the efficiency of the project juxtaposing the implementation progress indicators, with the financial indicators.

Chapter 5 briefly discusses internal management aspects, including identified risks concerning the implementation from the partners and communication issues.

1.1 Data sources

The current deliverable was based on a number of data sources for its completion. The sources included both qualitative and quantitative data from programme, project, and partner level. More in particular the following data sources have been taken into account:

- Programming Document "Interreg V-A Greece-Bulgaria 2014-2020"
- Project Approved Application Form
- Project Approved Justification of Budget
- Project Progress Reports (1&2)
- Project Management Plan
- Project Communication Plan
- 1st Evaluation and Impact Assessment Report
- Internal Project Survey
- Person to Person Communication

1.2 Reference Period

The current Evaluation and Impact Assessment Report has as a reference point the 01/10/2018 (i.e. reference period 12/10/2017 -01/10/2018).

2 SMiLe Project Overview

The SMiLe (Strengthening primary Medical care in IsoLated and deprived cross-border arEas) Project is planned to be primarily beneficial for the CB population located at remote and isolated areas without discriminations, while PHC Practitioners working in the territory will be also benefitted through their participation in targeted project activities. The main project aims at the (i) the upgrading of 6 PHC units and 3 small hospitals all located in remote and disadvantaged CB territories, (ii) the creation and operation of a modern Training Center for PHC Practitioners, (iii) a set of studies focusing on the improvement of the accessibility in selected Healthcare Units in the CB area, including the preparation of a toolbox for Equal Health Provision and (iv) the development and operation of an IT Platform for the evaluation of PHC Services.

The identity of the project is presented in the following table:

Table 1: Identity of the SMiLe Project

Acronym	SMiLe
Priority axis	Social inclusion
Investment priorities	9a
Call	2nd Call for proposals under priority axes 2 & 4
Lead Beneficiary	4th Health District of Macedonia-Thrace
Partners	Aristotle University of Thessaloniki, Department of Medicine Multi-profile Hospital for Active Treatment of Ardino Municipality of Harmanli National Emergency Aid Center
Budget	1.327.661,62 euro

The Project is organized in 6 Work packages with distinctive budget across the five partners as follows. The project is organized in more detail on a partner and WP level is specific deliverables and actions/tasks within them, described in detail in the Project Management Plan.

Table 2: Working Packages of the SMiLe project

WP No	Work Package	Start date	End date	Budget
WP 1	Project Management & Coordination	12/10/2017	11/10/2019	86,896.62 €
WP 2	Communication & Dissemination	12/10/2017	11/10/2019	60,210.00 €
WP 3	Upgrading of isolated PHC and Hospital units	01/12/2017	01/04/2019	877,324.00 €
WP 4	Studies to improve PHC services in CB area	01/12/2017	01/09/2019	69,001.20 €
WP 5	PHC practitioners' capacity building	01/12/2017	01/09/2019	196,155.00 €
WP 6	Citizens' oriented PHC Governance Plan	01/05/2018	01/09/2019	38,074.80 €

3 Evaluation of Effectiveness

The current section includes the:

- Analysis of the implementation progress level
- Evaluation of the implementation progress of the project in terms of effectiveness

per Internal Indicators (Output Indicators and Communication Indicators), Programme Indicators, and Financial indicators.

The reference point for the analysis is 12/10/2017-01/10/2018

The following analysis takes into account data from

- the Progress Reports of the Project
- the Internal survey of the project

3.1 Internal Indicators

The following section focuses on the internal output indicators of the project. These indicators were developed within the framework of the Project's Management Plan, and further detailed and operationalized in the 1st Evaluation and Impact Assessment Report.

The scope of these indicators is to monitor and evaluate the implementation progress of the project, but also prepare the necessary background for the analysis of the project's impact that will take place in the later stages of the implementation.

3.1.1 Output indicators

The current section summarizes the performance of the Output indicators. It should be noted that to assess the implementation of the project and in agreement with the monitoring system on a programme level, and in particular, with the performance framework rationale, when no data are available the implementation level is assessed based on other procedural indications. Therefore, the projections of achievement is assessed based on the level of completion of the procurement processes and/or based on the reported level of completion from the partners in the survey for each action of the deliverable.

As it is presented in Table 3 all of the internal output indicators are projected to achieve 100% completion level by the end of the project. While only a small part of the deliverables is currently implemented the qualitative data for the implementation suggest that overall the project will achieve its goals.

Table 3: Internal Output Indicators Performance

Deliverable	Indicator	Target (Completion of the Project)	Completion level	Projection	Comments
Deliverable 3.1.1	New Medical equipment in 9 PHC Unit	9	0	100	Procurement process initiated
Deliverable 3.3.1					Procurement process initiated
Deliverable 3.4.1					Procurement process initiated
Deliverable 6.1.3	IT platform for PHC assessment by the citizens	1	0	100	Contracted
Deliverable 6.1.1	Daily Stakeholders Engagement Events	2	0	100	Contracted, Planned for the next 3 months
Deliverable 6.1.1	Developing and Operating Stakeholder Network for PHC	1	0	100	Contracted, Planned for the next 3 months

Deliverable 4.2.1	Studies on PHC	1	40	100	In progress
Deliverable 5.2.2	Development of a training centre	1	0	100	Procurement process initiated
Deliverable 5.2.3	Trainings of PHC professionals	4	0	100	To be completed when D.5.2.2 is developed
Deliverable 2.2.3	Scientific Symposium	1	0	100	Scheduled later in the project
Deliverable 3.5.1	Procurement of ICT Equipment for Emergencies	1	0	100	Procurement process initiated
Deliverable 6.5.1	Trainings for Emergency aid	6	6	100	Completed

In particular, the indicators' progress is analysed as following:

- New Medical equipment in 9 PHC Unit: Even though no completion level can be reported for this indicator, the progress is projected to reach 100% since procurement processes have been initiated in all cases.
- IT platform for PHC assessment by the citizens: The IT platform has not yet been developed per se, though all the preparatory processes have been completed, including structure and content of the assessment process. The platform is expected to be finalized in the next 3 months.
- Daily Stakeholders Engagement Events: The events have been contracted and are scheduled to be implemented in the next 3 months.
- Developing and Operating Stakeholder Network for PHC: As the above
- Studies on PHC: The current study is being conducted by the AUTH partner and is reported to have achieved a 40% level of completion.
- Development of a training centre: The procurement process for development of the training centre is in progress.
- Trainings of PHC professionals: The training are depended upon the completion of D.5.2.2 though preparatory processes concerning the content of the trainings have been started.
- Scientific Symposium: The symposium is scheduled to be implemented later in the projects. The experience of the AUTH is such events ensures that the target will be achieved.
- Procurement of ICT Equipment for Emergencies: The procurement process for the ICT equipment for emergencies is under way and is expected to be completed on time.
- Trainings for Emergency aid: All six trainings have been implemented with approximately 160 member of the public being trained.

3.1.2 Communication indicators

The current section summarizes the performance of the Communication Indicators. Similarly to the output indicators above, projections have been made based on the internal processes of the project, the partners' surveys, and the expert opinion of the project managers of each partners.

Table 4: Communication Output Indicators Performance

Index	Target value	Achieved Value	Completion level	Projection	Comments
Information Kit	600	600	100	100	
Project Posters	10	10	100	100	
Newspapers articles of which	14	0	-	100	Scheduled for a later period
in Greece	6	0	-	100	
in Bulgaria	8	0	-	100	
Press Releases	12	8	67	100	
Project Events of which	5	0	-	100	Scheduled for a later period
in Greece	3	0	-	100	
in Bulgaria	2	0	-	100	
Project Trainings	6	6	100	100	
Conferences of which	2	0	-	100	Scheduled for a later period
in Greece	1	0	-	100	
in Bulgaria	1	0	-	100	
Scientific Conference (In Greece)	1	0	-	100	Scheduled for a later period
Press Conferences (in Bulgaria)	2	1	50	100	
Participants in Events	400	160	40	100	
Website development	1	1	100	100	
Unique visitors in website	1000	3	-	100	Web analytics operational from 30/10/2018
Accounts in Social Media	3	0	33	100	
Followers in Facebook	100	0	-	100	Campaign Scheduled for a later date
Followers in Twitter	100	0	-	100	Scheduled for a later period
Views in YouTube	300	0	-	100	Scheduled for a later period

As it is presented in Table 4 all of the internal communication indicators are projected to achieve 100% completion level by the end of the project. Since the communication indicators are based in actions that do not entail prolonged procurement and tendering procedures the completion level is higher than that of the output indicators.

In particular, the indicators' progress is analysed as following:

- Information Kit: The project information kits have been developed and are being distributed by the project partners in the respective events
- Project Posters: The Project partners have been developed and produced and are utilized in communication actions of the project

- Press Releases: A number of press releases have been already issued by partners achieving a 67% completion level of the target. The project press releases are expected to be higher than the target.
- Project Events: The project events are scheduled for a later period. In particular, the project events for the case of Greece are scheduled for the next three months.
- Project Trainings: The trainings planned within the framework of the project have been implemented in full and the current indicator has been achieved.
- Conferences: The current events are scheduled for a later period of the project. The experience of the partners in such events ensures that the target will be reached.
- Press Conferences: Already one press conference has taken place, i.e. 50% of the target is reached. The second press conference is scheduled for a later date in the project.
- Participants in Events: The trainings that were held within the framework of the programme already amounted to a 40% completion level. Since the conferences and the scientific conferences that are expected to attract greater attendance are yet to be implemented the target is expected to be achieved in full.
- Website development: The website has been developed and is online.
- Unique visitors in website: The web analytics have been activated in 30/10/2018. Therefore, no data are available yet.
- Accounts in Social Media: One of the three Social Media accounts have been already developed, while the other two are expected to be developed and linked to the webpage in the next three months.
- Followers in Facebook: Currently there are no followers in the Facebook page of the Smile project, nevertheless a social media campaign is to be launched at a later date.
- Followers in Twitter: As the above
- Views in YouTube: As the above

3.2 Programme Indicators

The current section is focusing on the Programme Output indicators. These indicators take into account the overall monitoring and performance scheme of the programme and to some extent they are incorporated in the internal monitoring and evaluation system of the project.

Table 5: Programme Output Indicators Performance

Indicator	Target (Completion of the Project)	Completion level	Projection
Number of health care institutions reorganized, modernized or reequipped	9,00	0	100
Number of health ICT systems developed	1,00	0	100
Population covered by improved health services	237487,00	0	100

Based on the analysis in section 3.1.1, the Programme output indicators are expected to be achieved in full by the completion of the project. A more detailed analysis concerning the

indicator "Population covered by improved health services" is going to take place at a later stage in the project as part of the impact assessment of the project.

3.3 Financial Indicators

The following section focuses on the financial data of the project. The current analysis is based on the progress reports that the project submitted to the JS. Additional data to assess the overall performance of the financial indicators has been taken into account from the survey of the partners.

Table 6 is summarizing the level of financial indicators progress. It should be noted that the analysis is taking into account the overall budget per partner and WP, and uses contracted budget as a data source for the estimation of the financial performance.

Due to the complexity of the financial syste

Table 6: Financial Indicators Performance

	4th Health District of Macedonia Thrace			Aristotle University of Thessaloniki			Multi-profile Hospital for Active Treatment of Ardino			Municipality of Harmanli			National Emergency Aid Center		
	Budgeted	Contracted	Spent	Budgeted	Contracted	Spent	Budgeted	Contracted	Spent	Budgeted	Contracted	Spent	Budgeted	Contracted	Spent
WP1	28.789,40 €	62	0	21.194,80 €	11	4	12.557,74 €	0	0	19.502,28 €	75	11	4.852,40 €	31	0
WP2	37.800,00 €	77	0	7.650,00 €	7	0	8.630,00 €	0	0	5.830,00 €	0	0	300,00 €	0	0
WP3	312.630,00 €	0	0	0,00 €	NA	NA	287.700,00 €	0	0	242.100,00 €	0	0	34.894,00 €	0	0
WP4	0,00 €	NA	NA	59.501,20 €	11	4	5.000,00 €	0	0	4.500,00 €	0	0	0,00 €	NA	NA
WP5	3.025,00 €	0	0	180.090,00 €	3	1	7.040,00 €	0	0	6.000,00 €	0	0	0,00 €	NA	NA
WP6	14.000,00 €	58	0	5.000,00 €	0	0	6.229,60 €	0	0	4.729,60 €	0	0	8.115,60 €	74	0
Total	396.244,40 €	14	0	273.436,00 €	6	2	327.157,34 €	0	0	282.661,88 €	5	1	48.162,00 €	16	0

4 Evaluation of Efficiency

Deliverable	Indicator	Target (Completion of the Project)	Completion level	Projection
Deliverable 3.1.1 Deliverable 3.3.1 Deliverable 3.4.1	New Medical equipment in 9 PHC Unit	9	0	100
Deliverable 6.1.3	IT platform for PHC assessment by the citizens	1	0	100
Deliverable 6.1.1	Daily Stakeholders Engagement Events (2)	2	0	100
Deliverable 6.1.1	Developing and Operating Stakeholder Network for PHC	1	0	100
Deliverable 4.2.1	Studies on PHC	1	0	100
Deliverable 5.2.2	Development of a training centre	0	0	100
Deliverable 5.2.3	Trainings of PHC professionals (4)	4	0	100
Deliverable 2.2.3	Scientific Symposium	1	0	100
Deliverable 3.5.1	Procurement of ICT Equipment for Emergencies	1	0	100
Deliverable 6.5.1	Trainings for Emergency aid	6	6	100

5 Management Structure Evaluation

For Citations Use Harvard Referency Style

More Information here

<https://www.mendeley.com/guides/harvard-citation-guide>

Referencing software like Mendeley is advised.

5.1.1 Heading 3

Role	Partner name	Country
Lead Beneficiary	4th Health District of Macedonia Thrace	Greece
Partner Beneficiary 2	Aristotle University of Thessaloniki - Special Account for Research Fund (Department of Medicine)	Greece
Partner Beneficiary 3	Multi-profile Hospital for Active Treatment of Ardino	Bulgaria
Partner Beneficiary 4	Municipality of Harmanli	Bulgaria
Partner Beneficiary 5	National Emergency Aid Center	Greece

In terms of Awareness	<p>To promote the role of the project in the Cross-Border Area of Greece-Bulgaria</p> <p>To promote the benefits for the people of the Cross-Border area as a result of the project implementation</p>
In terms of promoting the EU role	<p>To promote the role of European Funding to the everyday problems of the citizens</p> <p>To identify the contribution of the SMiLe project in improving access to primary and emergency health care (at isolated and deprived communities) of the Cross border area.</p>